

BIG BEAR AREA REGIONAL WASTEWATER AGENCY

Notice of a Special Meeting Administrative Committee

February 9, 2022 at 3:00 p.m.

Pursuant to AB 361, this meeting will be virtual because state and local officials are recommending measures to promote social distancing. Members of the public may listen and provide public comments telephonically during the Public Forum (Item 4).

Join the Zoom Meeting:

<https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81046260993?pwd=dIFGbDBMa2NjN2lXbEhMdIFhRG16UT09>

Meeting ID: 810 4626 0993

Passcode: 968470

Dial by your location

- +1 253 215 8782 US (Tacoma)
- +1 346 248 7799 US (Houston)
- +1 720 707 2699 US (Denver)
- +1 301 715 8592 US (Washington DC)
- +1 312 626 6799 US (Chicago)
- +1 646 558 8656 US (New York)

Find your local number: <https://us06web.zoom.us/u/k7SqUFTur>

1. CALL TO ORDER

2. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Dispensed

3. PUBLIC FORUM RESPONSE

None

4. PUBLIC FORUM

Public testimony is permitted at this time only matters listed on the posted agenda. State law prohibits the Agency from taking action on any items not listed on the posted agenda.

Please note that the Governing Board is making efforts to follow the spirit and intent of the Brown Act and other applicable laws regulating the conduct of public meetings, in order to maximize transparency and public access. It would be appreciated, although not mandatory, if communications of public comments related to items on the agenda are emailed to bburton@bbarwa.org on or before Wednesday, February 9, 2022 at 2:00 p.m. Please include in the email's subject line "Public Comment Item # (insert the number relevant to your comment)".

If it is not possible to submit an email by 2:00 p.m., and comments are submitted by email after that time or thru the Zoom chat feature during the meeting, every effort will be made

to attempt to review emails and Zoom chats during the course of the meeting. The Administrative Committee will endeavor to take a brief pause to allow the Board Secretary time to review the public's electronic communications. Every effort will be made during the meeting to read aloud all electronically submitted comments. Please note, all electronically submitted correspondence relating to this meeting will become part of the meeting record and will be cited within the meeting minutes. Please limit written comments to 300 words or less. In addition, prior to the close of public comment portions of the meeting, the Administrative Committee will provide the public an opportunity to verbally state their comment live via Zoom teleconference.

At meetings of the Governing Board, each individual speaker will be limited to five minutes or less of public testimony on each item on the agenda. Further, the cumulative time which any individual may provide public testimony during a meeting is 15 minutes. The Administrative Committee may waive these time limitations. Whenever a group of persons wishes to address the Administrative Committee on the same item, the Administrative Committee may request a spokesperson be chosen for the group or limit the number of such persons addressing the Administrative Committee. The Administrative Committee may rule out of order testimony that is unduly repetitious or irrelevant.

5. **OLD BUSINESS**

None

6. **NEW BUSINESS**

6.A. Compensation Study December 2021

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act and Government Code Section 54954.2, if you need special assistance to participate in an Agency meeting or other services offered by the Agency, please contact the Agency at (909) 584-4018. Notification at least 48 hours prior to the meeting or time when services are needed will assist Agency staff in assuring that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting or service.

Copies of staff reports or other written documentation relating to each item of business referred to on this agenda are on file in the office of the Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency and are available for public inspection during normal business hours.

Visit www.bbarwa.org to view and/or print the Agenda Package.



Big Bear Area Regional
Wastewater Agency
Jim Miller – Chair
Rick Herrick – Vice-Chair
John Green – Director
Bynette Mote – Director
Karyn Oxandaboure – Director

AGENDA ITEM: 6.A.

MEETING DATE: February 9, 2022

TO: Administrative Committee of the Governing Board of the Big Bear Area
Regional Wastewater Agency

FROM: David Lawrence, P.E., General Manager

PREPARED BY: Sonja Kawa, Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician

REVIEWED BY: Jennifer McCullar, Finance Manager

SUBJECT: Compensation Study December 2021

BACKGROUND & DISCUSSION:

The Agency engaged the services of Bryce Consulting in 2016 to conduct an Agency-wide classification and compensation study (the Study). The Study was completed in July 2017, accepted by the Governing Board in August 2017, and the recommended classification plan was implemented with a Pay Schedule effective August 22, 2017. It was agreed that staff should update its compensation study on an annual basis in order to monitor the labor market (within the comparable agency group used in the Study) in an effort keep pay scales in line with market, to better stabilize costs, and to avoid large, infrequent pay schedule adjustments that can be difficult to manage.

The compensation study was last updated by Bryce Consulting in November 2020 (the 2020 Study). The pay schedule was adjusted, effective January 30, 2021, based on those results and using the Agency's Compensation Studies policy (the Policy) which established guidelines for compensation studies and pay range adjustments. The current annual compensation study update was completed in December 2021 (the 2021 Study). The results of the 2021 Study show the Agency is 3.49% above the labor market, in aggregate, when comparing the Total Cash median across all classifications. Based on the Policy, the following actions are recommended:

Position	Variance from Labor Market Median	Indication
Finance Manager	Within +/- 5%	No Adjustment
Senior Laboratory Analyst	Within +/- 5%	No Adjustment
Management Analyst/Board Secretary	Within +/- 5%	No Adjustment
Plant Operator II	Within +/- 5%	No Adjustment
Plant Supervisor	> 5% below	Adjustment
Plant Manager	> 5% below	Adjustment
General Manager	> 5% above	Freeze
HR Coordinator/Acctg Tech	> 5% above	Freeze
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	> 5% above	Freeze
Operator-in-Training	> 5% above	Freeze

In addition to the above recommendations, staff is recommending a change in the starting pay rates for multiple positions. The pay ranges, from starting pay to top of scale, for the management positions at the Agency currently have a 45% spread. Other Agency positions have a 35% spread. Staff recommends setting the General Manager, Finance Manager, and Plant Manager starting pay at a 35% spread to top of scale for consistency and to bring starting pay more in line with market.

RECOMMENDATION:

The following adjustments to the pay schedule are recommended using the established Policy guidelines:

1. Adjust Plant Supervisor pay schedule by 1.52% to 5% below market.
2. Adjust Plant Manager pay schedule by 4.07% to 5% below market.
3. Freeze General Manager, Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician, Operations Administrative/Laboratory Assistant, and Operator-in-Training pay schedule – no COLA adjustment to pay range until after the next study or other determination.
4. Adjust pay range spread for General Manager, Finance Manager, and Plant Manager to 35% from starting pay to top of scale.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

There is no financial impact from making the recommended pay schedule adjustments during the current year, with net savings of approximately \$7,700 estimated for the subsequent fiscal year (FY 2023) as the higher expense associated with the pay schedule increases is more than offset by the pay schedule freezes.

ATTACHMENTS:

- Compensation Study – December 2021
- Appendix A Datasheets
- Appendix B Datasheets
- Pay Schedule Recommendation
- Informational: Compensation Studies policy

BRYCE
CONSULTING

BIG BEAR AREA REGIONAL WASTEWATER
AGENCY
COMPENSATION STUDY
DECEMBER 2021 – DRAFT

Prepared by
Bryce Consulting, Inc.
1024 Iron Point Road, Ste. 100
Folsom, CA 95630
916-974-0199



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section I – Introduction	3
--------------------------	---

Section II – Compensation Study Parameters	4
--	---

Section III - Compensation Survey Results	8
---	---

Section IV – Salary Recommendations	14
-------------------------------------	----

Appendix A – Detailed Datasheets

Appendix B – Miscellaneous Benefit Data

SECTION I - INTRODUCTION

The Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency retained Bryce Consulting to conduct an Agency-wide compensation study. This report presents the compensation survey results and includes:

Section I	Introduction
Section II	Compensation Survey Parameters
Section III	Compensation Survey Results
Section IV	Salary Recommendations

STUDY OBJECTIVES

In conducting the compensation study, Bryce Consulting, had the following major objectives:

- Research and recommend an appropriate labor market.
- Collect and analyze base salary and benefit data for the Agency's survey classes from the survey agencies.
- Develop a salary plan for all Agency classes using market data and internal relationships to ensure parity to the labor market and internal equity within the organization.

STUDY METHODOLOGY

To achieve the above objectives, the following tasks have occurred:

- The consultant analyzed the current labor market as well as collected information from additional agencies and reviewed with Agency management for the selection of survey classifications.
- The consultant collected salary and benefit data, as well as job descriptions to confirm comparability, from each of the agencies determined by the Agency.
- Once the data was collected and analyzed, the consultant prepared the necessary spreadsheets with calculations for both the mean and median which were reviewed with Agency management prior to finalizing the data.

SECTION II – COMPENSATION SURVEY PARAMETERS

This section of the report presents the compensation survey parameters and includes:

- Labor market employers and survey classes
- Survey scope
- Survey methodology

SURVEY EMPLOYERS

The overall objective in selecting survey employers is to define as accurately as possible the Agency's "Labor Market." The criteria typically utilized in identifying those employers includes the following:

- **EMPLOYER SIZE** - As a general rule, the more similar employers are in size and complexity, the greater the likelihood that comparable positions exist within both organizations. Specifically, agencies of similar size to the Agency are likely to have departmental structures and organization of positions more similar to the Agency than organizations that are significantly larger or smaller in size.
- **GEOGRAPHIC PROXIMITY** - Geographic proximity is another factor utilized in identifying an appropriate labor market. This factor is particularly important because it identifies those employers that the Agency must directly compete with to recruit and retain quality staff.
- **NATURE OF SERVICES PROVIDED** - As a general rule similar organizations are selected as survey employers, because they provide similar services. This is important for the following reasons:
 - Employers who provide similar services are most likely to compete with one another for employees.
 - These employers are most likely to have comparable jobs.
 - These employers are most likely to have similar organizational characteristics.

LABOR MARKET

As mentioned, Bryce researched the previously identified labor market as well as additional agencies based on the criteria provided on the previous page which was presented to Agency management. The Agency decided to continue using the same agencies that have been surveyed in recent studies. **Table 1** displays the survey agencies. Of the nine agencies surveyed, all were able to participate in the process.

TABLE 1 SURVEY AGENCIES
City of Barstow
City of Colton
City of Redlands
City of San Bernardino Water Department
Goleta Sanitary District
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District
Mountain View Sanitary District
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation
Yucaipa Valley Water District

SURVEY CLASSES

Given the relatively small size of the Agency, all classifications were surveyed as provided in **Table 2**. It should be noted that while the Agency does not have a Lab Analyst, the classification was surveyed in case there is insufficient data for the Senior Lab Analyst. In that instance, the Senior Lab Analyst salary can be set a certain percentage above the Lab Analyst market data.

TABLE 2 SURVEY CLASSIFICATIONS
Finance Manager
General Manager
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician
Lab Analyst
Management Analyst-Board Secretary
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant
Plant Supervisor
Plant Manager
Plant Operator II
Plant Operator-in-Training
Senior Lab Analyst

SURVEY SCOPE

The scope of the survey included the labor market agencies presented in this report. The data collected for each survey classification included:

- Title of comparable class
- Maximum monthly salary
- Employer pick-up of the employee contribution for retirement
- Employer contribution towards deferred compensation
- Longevity pay at year 7
- Education/certification pay
- Employer contribution towards health, dental, vision insurance
- Employer paid life insurance
- Employer paid long term disability insurance
- Retiree Health Savings Account contribution
- Social Security
- Employee cost sharing of employer contribution for retirement
- Cost of living information including date and amount of next cost of living increase
- Retirement plan, benefit, formula and employer's rate
- Retiree health benefit information
- Paid leave (vacation, sick leave, holidays, administrative/management leave)

It should be noted that benefit data was collected for newly hired employees, unless otherwise noted.

SURVEY METHODOLOGY

The survey methodology utilized by Bryce Consulting included:

- The consultant utilized the survey agencies' websites, where available, to collect base salary data and to collect and compare job descriptions, organization charts and position allocation lists to determine comparability.
- The consultant contacted the survey agencies to gain clarification and/or collect additional information regarding the classifications and salary and benefit data.

In addition to the collection of base salary information, careful efforts were made to document the full range of duties and requirements of all job classes as comparable to the Agency's corresponding survey classes. This included the collection of:

- Reporting relationships
- Functional areas of responsibility
- The class's relationship to other classes in the series

The data was analyzed to produce the labor market mean and median for each classification using maximum base salary, total cash and total compensation. The Agency's position was then compared to the labor market, for each survey classification, which produced the percentage the Agency is above or below the labor market mean and median for maximum base salary, total cash, and total compensation. The data is effective January 2022.

SECTION III – COMPENSATION SURVEY RESULTS

This section of the report presents the compensation survey findings. As indicated in the previous section, the survey involved the collection of compensation information for each of the survey classes from the labor market employers identified. **Table 3** displays the comparability for each survey classification out of the nine survey agencies.

TABLE 3 COMPARABILITY	
Survey Classifications	Number of Comparable Matches
Finance Manager	8
General Manager	6
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	6
Lab Analyst	4
Management Analyst-Board Secretary	7
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	5
Plant Supervisor	5
Plant Manager	5
Plant Operator II	6
Plant Operator-in-Training	4
Senior Lab Analyst	1*

*Insufficient Data

BASE SALARY SURVEY RESULTS

The data has been organized into a number of tables that summarize the Agency's relationship to the labor market for each class. The detailed compensation survey data sheets are presented in **Appendix A** of this report. **Table 4** summarizes, for each classification, how the Agency's base salaries compare to the labor market. The following data is presented:

- Title of the Agency's classification
- The Agency's current maximum base salary
- The labor market mean and median for maximum monthly base salary
- Percentage the Agency's maximum base salary is above or below the mean and median of the labor market

Table 4 Base Salary					
Classification	BBARWA Maximum Base Salary	Labor Market Mean Base	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Mean	Labor Market Median	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Median
Finance Manager	\$13,539	\$13,989	-3.32%	\$14,257	-5.30%
General Manager	\$19,836	\$19,899	-0.31%	\$19,552	1.43%
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$9,299	\$9,018	3.03%	\$8,804	5.33%
Lab Analyst	Market Check	\$7,584	Market Check	\$7,853	Market Check
Management Analyst- Board Secretary	\$7,509	\$7,922	-5.50%	\$7,951	-5.89%
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$6,271	\$5,207	16.96%	\$4,999	20.29%
Plant Supervisor	\$8,788	\$9,194	-4.62%	\$9,614	-9.40%
Plant Manager	\$12,705	\$13,053	-2.74%	\$14,129	-11.21%
Plant Operator II	\$6,500	\$6,690	-2.92%	\$6,437	0.97%
Plant Operator-in- Training	\$4,436	\$4,678	-5.47%	\$4,462	-0.58%
Senior Lab Analyst	\$8,488	Insuff Data	---	Insuff Data	---

TOTAL CASH SURVEY RESULTS

Total cash represents the maximum base salary, the employee's share of retirement paid by the agency for Classic tier, the employer's contribution towards deferred compensation, longevity pay at year 7, and education/certification pay. **Table 5** displays, for each classification, how the Agency compares to the labor market with respect to total cash for new Classic employees. The following data is presented:

- Title of the Agency's classification
- The Agency's current total cash for each classification
- The labor market mean and median for total cash
- Percentage the Agency's total cash is above or below the mean and median of the labor market

Table 5 Total Cash					
Classification	BBARWA Total Cash	Labor Market Mean Total Cash	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Mean	Labor Market Median Total Cash	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Median
Finance Manager	\$14,487	\$14,373	0.79%	\$14,607	-0.83%
General Manager	\$21,820	\$20,434	6.35%	\$19,671	9.85%
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$9,950	\$9,209	7.45%	\$8,889	10.67%
Lab Analyst	Market Check	\$7,842	Market Check	\$8,369	Market Check
Management Analyst- Board Secretary	\$8,034	\$8,162	-1.59%	\$8,031	0.05%
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$6,710	\$5,295	21.10%	\$5,349	20.29%
Plant Supervisor	\$9,403	\$9,593	-2.01%	\$10,024	-6.60%
Plant Manager	\$13,595	\$13,507	0.64%	\$14,854	-9.26%
Plant Operator II	\$6,955	\$6,970	-0.22%	\$6,828	1.83%
Plant Operator-in- Training	\$4,746	\$4,737	0.19%	\$4,489	5.43%
Senior Lab Analyst	\$9,082	Insuff Data	---	Insuff Data	---

TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RESULTS

Total compensation represents the elements provided in total cash plus the agency's contribution towards cafeteria, health, dental, vision, life and long-term disability insurance, Retiree Health Savings Account, Social Security, less the employer's share of retirement paid by the employee. **Table 6** displays, for each classification, how the Agency compares to the labor market with respect to total compensation for new Classic employees. The following data is presented:

- Title of the Agency's classification
- The Agency's current total compensation for each classification
- The labor market mean and median for total compensation
- Percentage the Agency's total compensation is above or below the mean and median of the labor market

Table 6 Total Compensation					
Classification	BBARWA Total Compensation	Labor Market Mean Total Compensation	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Mean	Labor Market Median Total Compensation	% BBARWA is Above or Below Market Median
Finance Manager	\$17,350	\$16,812	3.10%	\$17,508	-0.91%
General Manager	\$25,341	\$23,205	8.43%	\$23,237	8.30%
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$12,752	\$10,870	14.76%	\$10,294	19.28%
Lab Analyst	Market Check	\$10,556	Market Check	\$11,481	Market Check
Management Analyst- Board Secretary	\$10,810	\$10,040	7.12%	\$9,639	10.83%
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$9,468	\$7,226	23.68%	\$6,540	30.92%
Plant Supervisor	\$12,197	\$12,183	0.12%	\$13,144	-7.76%
Plant Manager	\$16,446	\$15,730	4.35%	\$16,338	0.66%
Plant Operator II	\$9,716	\$8,826	9.17%	\$8,504	12.48%
Plant Operator-in- Training	\$7,477	\$6,428	14.04%	\$5,812	22.27%
Senior Lab Analyst	\$11,872	Insuff Data	---	Insuff Data	---

RELATIONSHIP TO THE MARKET

On average, for all classifications surveyed, the Agency is 0.54% below market for maximum base salary, 3.63% above market for total cash, and 9.42% above market for total compensation when compared to the mean. When compared to the median, the Agency is 0.48% below market for maximum base salary, 3.49% above market for total cash, and 10.57% above market for total compensation.

MISCELLANEOUS BENEFIT DATA

Appendix B presents the miscellaneous benefit data that was collected including cost of living increase, retirement practices, retiree health benefits, certification/education pay, and paid leave.

COST OF LIVING INCREASE- APPENDIX B – TABLE 1

The Agency does not have a future cost of living increase scheduled. Four agencies have an increase scheduled for later in 2022, ranging from 1.5% up to 4%, based on the CPI, depending on bargaining unit.

RETIREMENT PRACTICES – APPENDIX B – TABLE 2

With respect to retirement practices, the Agency has a CalPERS retirement plan with a benefit of 2.7% @ 55 and a formula of Single Highest Year.

With respect to the survey agencies, all the responding agencies participate in CalPERS. With respect to the retirement benefit, four have a benefit of 2% @ 55; two have a benefit of 2.7% @ 55; two have a benefit of 2.5% @55; and one has a benefit of 2% @ 60. Seven have a formula of Single Highest Year and two have a benefit of Average of Final 3 years.

RETIREE MEDICAL BENEFITS – APPENDIX B – TABLE 3

The Agency does not contribute to a Retiree Health Savings Account but does contribute 90% of the highest HMO for retiree health benefits.

With respect to the survey agencies, none contribute to a Retiree Health Savings Account. Five of the survey agencies contribute to retiree health benefits ranging from the PEMHCA minimum to 100% based on years of service.

CERTIFICATION/EDUCATION PAY – APPENDIX B – TABLE 4

The Agency does not provide certification/education pay.

Seven of the survey agencies provide certification/education pay with the details varying by agency and bargaining unit. The details are provided in Table 4 of Appendix B.

LEAVE BENEFITS – APPENDIX B – TABLE 5

The Agency’s vacation accrual is 104 hours at year 1; 144 hours at year 7; 152 hours at year 11; 160 at year 12; 168 hours at year 13; 176 hours at year 14; 184 at year 15; and 192 at year 16. The Agency offers 12 days of sick leave per year with an unlimited accrual, observes 12 holidays, and provides 80 hours of administrative/management leave for exempt staff.

The labor market average for vacation is 86 hours at year 1; 129 hours at year 7; 158 hours at year

11; 161 at year 12; 163 hours at year 13; 165 hours at year 14; 173 at year 15; and 174 at year 16. The majority of the agencies provide 12 days of sick leave with an unlimited accrual. The labor market average for holidays ranges from 13.5 to 14, depending on bargaining unit. Eight of the agencies provide administrative/management leave, depending on classification, ranging from 20 to 120 hours.

SECTION IV – SALARY RECOMMENDATIONS

This section of the report presents the salary recommendations for all Agency classifications and includes the salary setting methodology and the salary recommendations.

In setting salary levels, both market data and internal relationships are taken into consideration so that the Agency's compensation plan is both competitive with the market and internally balanced. While both the mean and median were calculated, it is recommended that the labor market median be utilized for the purposes of setting salaries. The labor market median is less likely to be skewed by outliers.

Where sufficient data has been collected, the salary has generally been set to market; however, the internal alignment has been reviewed to ensure that like classifications are similarly situated and that there is sufficient spread between supervisor and highest level supervised. As a practical matter, there could be occasions when market data will skew internal alignments, or an internal relationship is a more logical method of setting the salary rather than relying on the market data.

The salary recommendations are presented in **Table 7** on the following page. In recommending salaries for the Agency, the consultant used the labor market median to set the top step of the Agency's classification. The Agency's Compensation Policy states that if total cash for a comparable position is plus or minus 5% from the labor market median, no adjustment in pay range is indicated. If total cash is more than 5% below the market median, an adjustment to the pay range to 5% below the labor market median is indicated, but no more than 10%. If total cash is more than 5% above the market median, an adjustment of the pay range to 5% above the market median is indicated, provided that position is currently vacant.

With respect to the implementation of the recommendations, there are a variety of options.

- The employee's salary is placed in their new range at their current salary. Where an employee's current salary is below the recommended range, the employee's salary is placed at the new starting salary. This is the most commonly utilized option for increases.
- Where an employee's current salary is above the maximum of the recommended range, the employee's salary is frozen (Y-rated) until the market catches up. Any new employees brought into the classification will be placed in the new lower range.

**TABLE 7
SALARY RECOMMENDATIONS**

Classification	Current Start	Current Top	Recommended Start	Recommended Top	Rationale
Finance Manager	\$53.87	\$78.11	\$53.87	\$78.11	No change; total cash is within 5% of market
General Manager	\$78.92	\$114.44	\$78.92	\$114.44	No change; freeze; total cash is more than 5% above market but position is filled
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$39.74	\$53.65	\$39.74	\$53.65	No change; freeze; total cash is more than 5% above market but position is filled
Management Analyst-Board Secretary	\$32.08	\$43.32	\$32.08	\$43.32	No change; total cash is within 5% of market
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$26.80	\$36.18	\$26.80	\$36.18	It is recommended that the salary be set 5% above market due to additional duties assigned; however, total cash is 20.29% above market. No change; freeze; total cash is more than 5% above market but position is filled
Plant Supervisor	\$37.55	\$50.70	\$38.13	\$51.47	Brought within 5% of market
Plant Manager	\$50.55	\$73.30	\$56.50	\$76.28	Brought within 5% of market
Plant Operator II	\$27.78	\$37.50	\$27.78	\$37.50	No change; total cash is within 5% of market
Plant Operator-in-Training	\$18.95	\$21.30	\$18.95	\$21.30	No change; total cash is within 5% of market
Senior Lab Analyst	\$36.28	\$48.97	\$36.28	\$48.97	10% above Lab Analyst market; within 5% of market; no change

APPENDIX A
DETAILED DATASHEETS

APPENDIX B
MISCELLANEOUS BENEFIT DATA

Classification	BBARWA Maximum Base Salary	Labor Market Median Base	% BBARWA is above or below Market Median	BBARWA Total Cash	Labor Market Median Total Cash	% BBARWA is above or below Market Median	BBARWA Total Compensation	Labor Market Total Median Compensation	% BBARWA is above or below Market Median	Comparability
Finance Manager	\$13,539	\$14,257	-5.30%	\$14,487	\$14,607	-0.83%	\$17,350	\$17,508	-0.91%	8
General Manager	\$19,836	\$19,552	1.43%	\$21,820	\$19,671	9.85%	\$25,341	\$23,237	8.30%	6
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$9,299	\$8,804	5.33%	\$9,950	\$8,889	10.67%	\$12,752	\$10,294	19.28%	6
Lab Analyst	Market Check	\$7,853	Market Check	Market Check	\$8,369	Market Check	Market Check	\$11,481	Market Check	4
Management Analyst-Board Secretary	\$7,509	\$7,951	-5.89%	\$8,034	\$8,031	0.05%	\$10,810	\$9,639	10.83%	7
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$6,271	\$4,999	20.29%	\$6,710	\$5,349	20.29%	\$9,468	\$6,540	30.92%	5
Plant Supervisor	\$8,788	\$9,614	-9.40%	\$9,403	\$10,024	-6.60%	\$12,197	\$13,144	-7.76%	5
Plant Manager	\$12,705	\$14,129	-11.21%	\$13,595	\$14,854	-9.26%	\$16,446	\$16,338	0.66%	5
Plant Operator II	\$6,500	\$6,437	0.97%	\$6,955	\$6,828	1.83%	\$9,716	\$8,504	12.48%	6
Plant Operator-in-Training	\$4,436	\$4,462	-0.58%	\$4,746	\$4,489	5.43%	\$7,477	\$5,812	22.27%	4
Senior Lab Analyst	\$8,488	Insuff Data	---	\$9,082	Insuff Data	---	\$11,872	Insuff Data	---	1
		Average	-0.48%		Average	3.49%		Average	10.67%	

Classification	BBARWA Maximum Base Salary	Labor Market Mean Base	% BBARWA is above or below Market Mean	BBARWA Total Cash	Labor Market Mean Total Cash	% BBARWA is above or below Market Mean	BBARWA Total Compensation	Labor Market Total Mean Compensation	% BBARWA is above or below Market Mean	Comparability
Finance Manager	\$13,539	\$13,989	-3.32%	\$14,487	\$14,373	0.79%	\$17,350	\$16,812	3.10%	8
General Manager	\$19,836	\$19,899	-0.31%	\$21,820	\$20,434	6.35%	\$25,341	\$23,205	8.43%	6
Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$9,299	\$9,018	3.03%	\$9,950	\$9,209	7.45%	\$12,752	\$10,870	14.76%	6
Lab Analyst	Market Check	\$7,584	Market Check	Market Check	\$7,842	Market Check	Market Check	\$10,556	Market Check	4
Management Analyst-Board Secretary	\$7,509	\$7,922	-5.50%	\$8,034	\$8,162	-1.59%	\$10,810	\$10,040	7.12%	7
Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$6,271	\$5,207	16.96%	\$6,710	\$5,295	21.10%	\$9,468	\$7,226	23.68%	5
Plant Supervisor	\$8,788	\$9,194	-4.62%	\$9,403	\$9,593	-2.01%	\$12,197	\$12,183	0.12%	5
Plant Manager	\$12,705	\$13,053	-2.74%	\$13,595	\$13,507	0.64%	\$16,446	\$15,730	4.35%	5
Plant Operator II	\$6,500	\$6,690	-2.92%	\$6,955	\$6,970	-0.22%	\$9,716	\$8,826	9.17%	6
Plant Operator-in-Training	\$4,436	\$4,678	-5.47%	\$4,746	\$4,737	0.19%	\$7,477	\$6,428	14.04%	4
Senior Lab Analyst	\$8,488	Insuff Data	---	\$9,082	Insuff Data	---	\$11,872	Insuff Data	---	1
		Average	-0.54%		Average	3.63%		Average	9.42%	

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Finance Manager	\$13,539	3%	\$406	\$406	\$135	\$0	\$14,487	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$196	\$17,350	0%	\$0	\$17,350	
City of Barstow	No Comparable Class																				
City of Colton	Finance Manager	\$9,827	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$9,827	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$44	\$0	\$142	\$11,121	0%	\$0	\$11,121	
City of Redlands	Assistant Director, Finance	\$14,290	0%	\$0	\$380	\$0	\$0	\$14,670	\$0	\$913	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$967	\$16,699	0%	\$0	\$16,699	Reports to Finance Director
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Director of Finance	\$18,460	0%	\$0	\$108	\$0	\$0	\$18,568	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$59	\$0	\$268	\$20,563	4%	\$738	\$19,825	
Goleta Sanitary District	Finance and Human Resources Manager	\$14,224	7%	\$996	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$15,220	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$103	\$95	\$0	\$966	\$18,897	0%	\$0	\$18,897	Over Finance and Human Resources
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Finance Manager	\$14,914	0%	\$0	\$0	\$287	\$225	\$15,426	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$45	\$29	\$0	\$976	\$18,809	0%	\$0	\$18,809	Over Finance, Customer Service, and Information Systems
Mountain View Sanitary District	Chief Financial Officer/Administrative Services Manager	\$13,928	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$13,928	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$144	\$0	\$961	\$17,393	0%	\$0	\$17,393	Over Finance and Human Resources
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	Controller	\$11,726	0%	\$0	\$352	\$137	\$586	\$12,801	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$170	\$14,132	0%	\$0	\$14,132	
Yucaipa Valley Water District	Chief Financial Officer	\$14,544	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$14,544	\$0	\$1,961	\$105	\$0	\$11	\$32	\$0	\$970	\$17,624	0%	\$0	\$17,624	
Labor Market Mean		\$13,989						\$14,373									\$16,905			\$16,812	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-3.32%						0.79%									2.57%			3.10%	
Labor Market Median		\$14,257						\$14,607									\$17,508			\$17,508	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		-5.30%						-0.83%									-0.91%			-0.91%	
# of Comparable Matches		8																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	General Manager	\$19,836	3%	\$595	\$1,190	\$198	\$0	\$21,820	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$576	\$0	\$0	\$288	\$25,341	0%	\$0	\$25,341	Grade III Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator cert is desired with the ability to obtain Grade IV within 5 years
City of Barstow	No Comparable Class																				
City of Colton	No Comparable Class																				
City of Redlands	No Comparable Class																				
City of San Bernardino Water Department	General Manager	\$22,809	0%	\$0	\$108	\$0	\$0	\$22,917	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$59	\$0	\$331	\$24,975	4%	\$912	\$24,063	
Goleta Sanitary District	General Manager	\$20,097	7%	\$1,407	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$21,504	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$103	\$95	\$0	\$1,051	\$25,266	0%	\$0	\$25,266	Possession of a valid certificate of registration as a Civil Engineer issued by the California Board for Professional Engineers, Land Surveyors, and Geologists.
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	General Manager	\$18,723	0%	\$0	\$562	\$360	\$0	\$19,645	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$56	\$29	\$0	\$1,031	\$23,094	0%	\$0	\$23,094	
Mountain View Sanitary District	District Manager	\$19,697	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$19,697	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$279	\$0	\$1,045	\$23,381	0%	\$0	\$23,381	Registration as a Professional Engineer in the State of California and/or possession of a Wastewater Operator Grade IV Certification issued by the State Water Resources Control Board is highly desirable
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	General Manager	\$18,659	0%	\$0	\$560	\$218	\$0	\$19,437	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$271	\$20,869	0%	\$0	\$20,869	MA desired
Yucaipa Valley Water District	General Manager	\$19,407	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$19,407	\$0	\$1,961	\$105	\$0	\$11	\$32	\$0	\$1,041	\$22,557	0%	\$0	\$22,557	No spec
Labor Market Mean		\$19,899						\$20,434									\$23,357			\$23,205	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-0.31%						6.35%									7.83%			8.43%	
Labor Market Median		\$19,552						\$19,671									\$23,237			\$23,237	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		1.43%						9.85%									8.30%			8.30%	
# of Comparable Matches		6																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Human Resources Coordinator/Accounting Technician	\$9,299	3%	\$279	\$279	\$93	\$0	\$9,950	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$135	\$12,752	0%	\$0	\$12,752	BA
City of Barstow	Human Resources Manager	\$9,896	0%	\$0	\$99	\$0	\$0	\$9,995	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$143	\$11,152	0%	\$0	\$11,152	BA; can supervise per job description, but no other staff in HR
City of Colton	Human Resources Analyst	\$6,864	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,864	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$31	\$0	\$100	\$8,101	0%	\$0	\$8,101	BA
City of Redlands	Human Resources Analyst	\$7,711	0%	\$0	\$72	\$0	\$0	\$7,783	\$0	\$913	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$590	\$9,435	0%	\$0	\$9,435	BA
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Human Resources Coordinator	\$11,546	0%	\$0	\$108	\$0	\$0	\$11,654	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$38	\$0	\$167	\$13,528	4%	\$462	\$13,066	BA; supervises 2 staff
Goleta Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Human Resources Manager	\$11,130	0%	\$0	\$0	\$214	\$225	\$11,569	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$33	\$26	\$0	\$851	\$14,813	0%	\$0	\$14,813	No BA required, but duties are consistent; Supervises one HR Administrative Analyst
Mountain View Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	Human Resources Technician	\$6,960	0%	\$0	\$0	\$81	\$348	\$7,389	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$101	\$8,651	0%	\$0	\$8,651	BA; duties consistent with an Analyst
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				
Labor Market Mean		\$9,018						\$9,209									\$10,947			\$10,870	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		3.03%						7.45%									14.16%			14.76%	
Labor Market Median		\$8,804						\$8,889									\$10,294			\$10,294	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		5.33%						10.67%									19.28%			19.28%	
# of Comparable Matches		6																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Lab Analyst	Market Check						Market Check									Market Check			Market Check	
City of Barstow	No Comparable Class																				
City of Colton	No Comparable Class																				
City of Redlands	Lab Analyst II	\$5,013	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$5,013	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$383	\$6,447	0%	\$0	\$6,447	Grade II Lab Analyst cert
City of San Bernardino Water Department	No Comparable Class																				
Goleta Sanitary District	Lab Analyst II	\$7,705	7%	\$539	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$8,244	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$76	\$69	\$0	\$589	\$11,494	0%	\$0	\$11,494	AA; Grade I Laboratory Analyst Certificate is required; Grade II within 18 months
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Lab Analyst	\$8,000	0%	\$0	\$65	\$154	\$275	\$8,494	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$12	\$19	\$0	\$612	\$11,469	0%	\$0	\$11,469	BA; Grade III Laboratory Analyst Certificate; Grade I Environmental Compliance Inspector Certificate; Grade I Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate; Grade TI Water Treatment Plant Operator Certificate; Grade DI Water Distribution Operator Certificate
Mountain View Sanitary District	Lab Analyst	\$9,618	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$9,618	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$99	\$0	\$736	\$12,813	0%	\$0	\$12,813	Grade II Laboratory Analyst Certificate within 12 months; AA; BA desired
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	No Comparable Class																				Contracted out
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				
Labor Market Mean		\$7,584						\$7,842									\$10,556			\$10,556	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		Market Check						Market Check									Market Check			Market Check	
Labor Market Median		\$7,853						\$8,369									\$11,481			\$11,481	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		Market Check						Market Check									Market Check			Market Check	
# of Comparable Matches		4																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Management Analyst-Board Secretary	\$7,509	3%	\$225	\$225	\$75	\$0	\$8,034	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$109	\$10,810	0%	\$0	\$10,810	
City of Barstow	Senior Administrative Analyst	\$7,951	0%	\$0	\$80	\$0	\$0	\$8,031	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$115	\$9,160	0%	\$0	\$9,160	
City of Colton	Administrative Analyst II	\$6,365	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$318	\$6,683	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$29	\$0	\$92	\$7,953	0%	\$0	\$7,953	
City of Redlands	Management Analyst	\$7,121	0%	\$0	\$72	\$0	\$0	\$7,193	\$0	\$913	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$545	\$8,800	0%	\$0	\$8,800	
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Executive Assistant to the General Manager	\$9,348	0%	\$0	\$108	\$0	\$0	\$9,456	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$31	\$0	\$136	\$11,291	4%	\$374	\$10,917	AA
Goleta Sanitary District	Management Analyst	\$8,802	7%	\$616	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$9,418	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$87	\$79	\$0	\$673	\$12,772	0%	\$0	\$12,772	
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	No Comparable Class																				Executive Assistant requires high school diploma
Mountain View Sanitary District	Board Secretary/Executive Assistant	\$7,989	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$7,989	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$83	\$0	\$611	\$11,043	0%	\$0	\$11,043	10 years of experience or BA required
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	Secretary to the General Manager/Board Secretary	\$7,878	0%	\$0	\$0	\$92	\$394	\$8,364	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$114	\$9,639	0%	\$0	\$9,639	AA
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				General Manager serves as Board Secretary
Labor Market Mean		\$7,922						\$8,162									\$10,094			\$10,040	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-5.50%						-1.59%									6.63%			7.12%	
Labor Market Median		\$7,951						\$8,031									\$9,639			\$9,639	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		-5.89%						0.05%									10.83%			10.83%	
# of Comparable Matches		7																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Operations Administrative-Lab Assistant	\$6,271	3%	\$188	\$188	\$63	\$0	\$6,710	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$91	\$9,468	0%	\$0	\$9,468	
City of Barstow	Administrative Assistant	\$5,447	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$5,447	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$79	\$6,540	0%	\$0	\$6,540	
City of Colton	Administrative Assistant	\$4,308	0%	\$0	\$0	\$86	\$0	\$4,394	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$19	\$0	\$62	\$5,625	0%	\$0	\$5,625	
City of Redlands	Administrative Assistant II	\$4,405	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,405	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$337	\$5,792	0%	\$0	\$5,792	
City of San Bernardino Water Department	No Comparable Class																				
Goleta Sanitary District	Administrative Assistant	\$4,999	7%	\$350	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$5,349	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$49	\$45	\$0	\$382	\$8,340	0%	\$0	\$8,340	
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	No Comparable Class																				
Mountain View Sanitary District	Administrative Assistant	\$6,878	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,878	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$71	\$0	\$526	\$9,835	0%	\$0	\$9,835	
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	No Comparable Class																				
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				
Labor Market Mean		\$5,207						\$5,295									\$7,226			\$7,226	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		16.96%						21.10%									23.68%			23.68%	
Labor Market Median		\$4,999						\$5,349									\$6,540			\$6,540	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		20.29%						20.29%									30.92%			30.92%	
# of Comparable Matches		5																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Plant Supervisor	\$8,788	3%	\$264	\$264	\$88	\$0	\$9,403	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$127	\$12,197	0%	\$0	\$12,197	Over Operations and Maintenance; Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate, or possession of a Grade III with the ability to obtain a Grade IV within 24 months. Grade II Collection System Maintenance Certificate and a Grade I Plant Maintenance Certificate as issued by the California Water Environment Association, or the ability to obtain within two (2) years of employment.
City of Barstow	No Comparable Class																				WWTP Supervisor not budgeted
City of Colton	Wastewater Utilities Supervisor	\$8,007	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$400	\$8,407	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$36	\$0	\$116	\$9,708	0%	\$0	\$9,708	Over Operations and Maintenance; Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator; Grade V is
City of Redlands	Wastewater Operations Supervisor	\$8,580	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$8,580	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$656	\$10,286	0%	\$0	\$10,286	Over Operations and Maintenance; Grade IV Wastewater Operator Certificate; Grade V Wastewater Operator Certificate is desirable; Grade IV Laboratory Analyst Certificate is desirable.
City of San Bernardino Water Department	No Comparable Class																				Separate supervisors over operations and maintenance
Goleta Sanitary District	Wastewater Plant Operations Supervisor	\$9,766	7%	\$684	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$10,450	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$96	\$88	\$0	\$747	\$13,895	0%	\$0	\$13,895	Over Operations and Maintenance; Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate; Water Environment Laboratory Technologists Grade I certificate
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Wastewater Operations Supervisor	\$9,614	0%	\$0	\$0	\$185	\$225	\$10,024	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$29	\$22	\$0	\$735	\$13,144	0%	\$0	\$13,144	Over Operations and Maintenance; Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate Supervisory level; Over Operations and
Mountain View Sanitary District	Lead Wastewater Operator	\$10,002	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$500	\$10,502	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	\$152	\$152	\$103	\$0	\$765	\$13,882	0%	\$0	\$13,882	Maintenance; Class B driver's license with tanker and air brake endorsements within nine months; Grade III Wastewater Treatment Operator Certificate; Water Environmental Association (CWEA) Grade I Plant Maintenance Technologist Certificate within two years of appointment; California Water Environmental Association (CWEA) Grade II Collections Certificate within two years of appointment; Transportation Worker Identification Credential (TWIC) within one year of appointment. This credential requires a Transportation Security Administration (TSA) level background check.
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	No Comparable Class																				Separate supervisors over operations and maintenance
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				Over water and wastewater treatment
Labor Market Mean		\$9,194						\$9,593									\$12,183			\$12,183	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-4.62%						-2.01%									0.12%			0.12%	
Labor Market Median		\$9,614						\$10,024									\$13,144			\$13,144	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		-9.40%						-6.60%									-7.76%			-7.76%	
# of Comparable Matches		5																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Plant Manager	\$12,705	3%	\$381	\$381	\$127	\$0	\$13,595	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$184	\$16,446	0%	\$0	\$16,446	BA; Grade IV Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator; Grade II Collection System Maintenance certificate and Grade I Plant Maintenance certificate
City of Barstow	Wastewater Treatment Plant Superintendent	\$9,230	0%	\$0	\$92	\$0	\$0	\$9,322	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$134	\$10,470	0%	\$0	\$10,470	BA desired; Must obtain a Class A or B license within 12 months of appointment; Grade V Water Treatment Operator Certificate is required; Grade IV Water Distribution Operator Certificate is required
City of Colton	No Comparable Class																				Over water and wastewater treatment
City of Redlands	No Comparable Class																				
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Water Reclamation Operations Superintendent	\$14,800	0%	\$0	\$54	\$0	\$0	\$14,854	\$1,808	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$49	\$0	\$215	\$16,930	4%	\$592	\$16,338	No BA; Grade V Wastewater Treatment Operator; Water Reclamation Maintenance Superintendent is lower paid
Goleta Sanitary District	Plant Operations Manager	\$11,849	7%	\$829	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$12,678	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$103	\$95	\$0	\$906	\$16,296	0%	\$0	\$16,296	BA is one option; Grade I Laboratory Technologist Certificate within 18 months of hire date; Grade V Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate within 18 months of hire date
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	No Comparable Class																				Over water and wastewater treatment
Mountain View Sanitary District	Operations Manager/Chief Plant Operator	\$15,258	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$15,258	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$158	\$0	\$981	\$18,756	0%	\$0	\$18,756	BA is one option; Grade V Wastewater Treatment Operator Certificate; California's Class B driver's license within nine months of appointment is highly desirable
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	Plant Superintendent	\$14,129	0%	\$0	\$424	\$165	\$706	\$15,424	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$205	\$16,790	0%	\$0	\$16,790	No BA; Grade V Wastewater Treatment Certification
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				Over water and wastewater treatment
Labor Market Mean		\$13,053						\$13,507									\$15,849			\$15,730	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-2.74%						0.64%									3.63%			4.35%	
Labor Market Median		\$14,129						\$14,854									\$16,790			\$16,338	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		-11.21%						-9.26%									-2.10%			0.66%	
# of Comparable Matches		5																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Plant Operator II	\$6,500	3%	\$195	\$195	\$65	\$0	\$6,955	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$94	\$9,716	0%	\$0	\$9,716	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator
City of Barstow	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator	\$4,931	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,931	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$71	\$6,016	0%	\$0	\$6,016	Class A license within 12 months; Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator must have the ability to obtain a California Wastewater Treatment Operator II Certificate or higher within 4 testing cycles. Collection System Maintenance. Grade II is desirable
City of Colton	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator II	\$6,292	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$315	\$6,606	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$10	\$28	\$0	\$91	\$7,878	0%	\$0	\$7,878	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator; Grade III desired
City of Redlands	Wastewater Facilities Operator II	\$5,997	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$5,997	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$459	\$7,506	0%	\$0	\$7,506	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator
City of San Bernardino Water Department	No Comparable Class																				Water Reclamation Operator requires Grade I; Senior requires Grade III
Goleta Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator II now requires Grade III certificate
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator II	\$6,583	0%	\$0	\$65	\$127	\$275	\$7,049	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$10	\$15	\$0	\$504	\$9,911	0%	\$0	\$9,911	Grade II Water Treatment Plant Operator Certificate issued by the SWRCB, OR a Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate issued by the SWRCB. Grade I Certificate in the opposite certification program issued by the SWRCB or the SWRCB.
Mountain View Sanitary District	Wastewater Operator II	\$8,930	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$447	\$9,377	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$92	\$0	\$683	\$12,512	0%	\$0	\$12,512	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	Operator II	\$7,405	0%	\$0	\$0	\$86	\$370	\$7,862	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$107	\$9,130	0%	\$0	\$9,130	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				Water and wastewater treatment
Labor Market Mean		\$6,690						\$6,970									\$8,826			\$8,826	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-2.92%						-0.22%									9.17%			9.17%	
Labor Market Median		\$6,437						\$6,828									\$8,504			\$8,504	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		0.97%						1.83%									12.48%			12.48%	
# of Comparable Matches		6																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Plant Operator-in-Training	\$4,436	3%	\$133	\$133	\$44	\$0	\$4,746	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$64	\$7,477	0%	\$0	\$7,477	OIT certificate with Grade I no later than 18 months
City of Barstow	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator In Training	\$4,464	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$4,464	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$65	\$5,543	0%	\$0	\$5,543	Class A license within 12 months of appointment; must obtain a California Wastewater Treatment Operator I Certificate or higher within 4 testing cycles of receiving your Operator in Training Certificate or 24 months of appointment, whichever comes first. Must obtain a California Wastewater Treatment Operator II Certificate or higher within 4-testing cycles of receiving your California Wastewater Treatment Operator I Certificate.
City of Colton	Wastewater Operator In Training	\$3,623	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$181	\$3,804	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$10	\$16	\$0	\$53	\$5,024	0%	\$0	\$5,024	No Spec available
City of Redlands	No Comparable Class																				
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Water Reclamation Trainee	\$4,459	0%	\$0	\$54	\$0	\$0	\$4,513	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$3	\$15	\$0	\$65	\$6,259	4%	\$178	\$6,081	Water Reclamation Trainee positions in the Operations Section must possess a valid Grade I Operator-in-Training certificate or must present proof of passing the Grade I Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator examination within the three (3) years prior to application. A copy of the Grade I Operator-in-Training certificate or proof of passing the Grade I Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator examination must be provided at the time of application; Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate Grade I or an Environmental Compliance Inspector Grade I must be obtained within eighteen (18) months for continued employment
Goleta Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	No Comparable Class																				
Mountain View Sanitary District	Wastewater Operator Trainee	\$6,167	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$6,167	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$64	\$0	\$472	\$9,062	0%	\$0	\$9,062	Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator-in-Training Certificate within three months of appointment; obtain a valid Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator Certificate within thirty-six (36) months of employment (Did not include 5% for Grade V cert pay)
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	No Comparable Class																				Do not use OIT
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				Water and wastewater treatment
Labor Market Mean		\$4,678						\$4,737									\$6,472			\$6,428	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		-5.47%						0.19%									13.44%			14.04%	
Labor Market Median		\$4,462						\$4,489									\$5,901			\$5,812	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		-0.58%						5.43%									21.08%			22.27%	
# of Comparable Matches		4																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Classification Title	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	Senior Lab Analyst	\$8,488	3%	\$255	\$255	\$85	\$0	\$9,082	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$123	\$11,872	0%	\$0	\$11,872	Grade II Wastewater Treatment Plant Operator within 2 years; Grade I Environmental Compliance Inspector and Grade II Lab Analyst within 2 years; Water Treatment Operator Grade 1 within 2 years
City of Barstow	No Comparable Class																				
City of Colton	No Comparable Class																				
City of Redlands	Lab Analyst IV	\$5,820	0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$5,820	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$445	\$7,315	0%	\$0	\$7,315	Grade IV Lab Analyst cert
City of San Bernardino Water Department	No Comparable Class																				
Goleta Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	No Comparable Class																				
Mountain View Sanitary District	No Comparable Class																				
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	No Comparable Class																				Contracted out
Yucaipa Valley Water District	No Comparable Class																				
Labor Market Mean		Insuff Data						Insuff Data									Insuff Data			Insuff Data	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Mean		---						---									---			---	
Labor Market Median		Insuff Data						Insuff Data									Insuff Data			Insuff Data	
% BBARWA is above or below Labor Market Median		---						---									---			---	
# of Comparable Matches		1																			

Data effective as of 1/2022

New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Bargaining Unit	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	all		3%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$9	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,667	0%	\$0	\$2,667	
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	all		3%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,432	\$203	\$22	\$576	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$3,233	0%	\$0	\$3,233	
City of Barstow	1		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$0	\$1,014	0%	\$0	\$1,014	
City of Barstow	2		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$0	\$1,014	0%	\$0	\$1,014	
City of Barstow	6		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,000	inc	inc	inc	\$14	DNA	\$0	\$0	\$1,014	0%	\$0	\$1,014	
City of Colton	conf		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,107	0%	\$0	\$1,107	
City of Colton	mm		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,149	0%	\$0	\$1,149	
City of Colton	ibew-ww		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$10	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,152	0%	\$0	\$1,152	
City of Colton	general		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,142	inc	inc	inc	\$7	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,149	0%	\$0	\$1,149	
City of Redlands	RAME mngr		0%	\$0	\$94	\$0	\$0	\$94	\$0	\$913	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,156	0%	\$0	\$1,156	
City of Redlands	RAMME Mid Managemen		0%	\$0	\$72	\$0	\$0	\$72	\$0	\$913	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,134	0%	\$0	\$1,134	
City of Redlands	Teamsters		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$900	\$127	\$19	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,050	0%	\$0	\$1,050	
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Mngt/Conf		0%	\$0	\$108	\$0	\$0	\$108	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,776	4%	\$0	\$1,776	
City of San Bernardino Water Department	MM		0%	\$0	\$54	\$0	\$0	\$54	\$1,808	inc	inc	inc	\$4	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,866	4%	\$0	\$1,866	
City of San Bernardino Water Department	General		0%	\$0	\$54	\$0	\$0	\$54	\$1,664	inc	inc	inc	\$3	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,721	4%	\$0	\$1,721	
Goleta Sanitary District	all		7%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,294	\$198	\$23	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,515	0%	\$0	\$2,515	
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	MSC		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	ind	\$0	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,333	0%	\$0	\$2,333	

Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	Utility worker 557		0%	\$0	\$65	\$0	\$275	\$340	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,673	0%	\$0	\$2,673	
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	GM		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,190	\$143	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,333	0%	\$0	\$2,333	
Survey Agency	Bargaining Unit	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments	
Mountain View Sanitary District	all		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	ind	\$0	\$0	\$1,937	\$271	inc	\$152	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,360	0%	\$0	\$2,360		
Survey Agency	Bargaining Unit	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments	
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	contract-GM Only		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$0	\$1,161	0%	\$0	\$1,161		
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	contract=others		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$0	\$1,161	0%	\$0	\$1,161		
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	misc		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,100	inc	inc	inc	\$32	\$30	\$0	\$0	\$1,161	0%	\$0	\$1,161		
Survey Agency	Bargaining Unit	Maximum Salary	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (%) (Classic)	EE Portion of Retirement Paid by ER (\$) (Classic)	Deferred Comp	Longevity Pay (Year 7)	Education / Certification Pay	Total Cash	Cafeteria Plan	Health	Dental	Vision	Life Insurance	LTD Insurance	RHSA	Social Security / Medi Care	Total Comp	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (%)	ER Share of PERS paid by EE (\$)	Total Comp Less ER Share of PERS paid by EE	Comments	
Yucaipa Valley Water District	GM		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,961	\$105	\$0	\$11	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,077	0%	\$0	\$2,077		
Yucaipa Valley Water District	Mngt		0%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$1,961	\$105	\$0	\$11	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$2,077	0%	\$0	\$2,077		

APPENDIX B TABLE 1
Next COLA/Salary Range Increase¹

Survey Agency	Next COLA/Salary Range Increase (Date/Amount)
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	<i>None Scheduled</i>
City of Barstow	None Scheduled
City of Colton	Confidential None Scheduled-in negotiations Mid Management 7/2022-1.5% IBEW-Water/Wastewater 1/2023-2% General 7/2022- 1.5%
City of Redlands	None Scheduled
City of San Bernardino Water Department	Management None Scheduled Confidential 7/2022-up to 4% based on CPI Mid Management 7/2022-up to 4% based on CPI General 7/2022-up to 4% based on CPI
Goleta Sanitary District	TBD based on salary study
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	MSC None Scheduled

¹ (1/2022 data already included in datasheets)

APPENDIX B TABLE 1
Next COLA/Salary Range Increase¹

Survey Agency	Next COLA/Salary Range Increase (Date/Amount)
	557 1/2023- 1% to 3% CPI based
Mountain View Sanitary District	7/2022-TBD
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	None Scheduled
Yucaipa Valley Water District	Management 7/2022-2.5%

APPENDIX B TABLE 2
Retirement Practices
New Hires, Classic Members

Survey Agency	Retirement Benefit	Retirement Formula	Retirement Plan	Employer Contribution (21/22)
<i>Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency</i>	<i>PERS</i>	<i>2.7% @ 55</i>	<i>Single Highest Year</i>	<i>14.87%</i>
City of Barstow	PERS	2.7% @ 55	Single Highest Year	14.02%
City of Colton	PERS	2.5% @ 55	Single Highest Year	11.05%
City of Redlands	PERS	2% @ 55	Single Highest Year	9.32%
City of San Bernardino Water Department	PERS	2% @ 55	Single Highest year	10.71%
Goleta Sanitary District	PERS	2% @ 55	Single Highest Year	11.6%
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	PERS	2% @ 55	Highest 3 Years	10.34%
Mountain View Sanitary District	PERS	2.7% @ 55	Single Highest Year	15.87%
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	PERS	2.5% @ 55	Highest 3 Year	11.59%
Yucaipa Valley Water District	PERS	2% @ 60	Single Highest Year	9.13%

APPENDIX B TABLE 3
Retiree Health Benefits
(New Hires)

Agency	Agency Contribution to Retiree Health Savings	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 1	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 2	Vesting
<i>Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency</i>	\$0	<p align="center"><i>Less than 5 years - PEMHCA Minimum</i> <i>5 – 9 years = 25%</i> <i>10 – 14 = 50%</i> <i>15 – 19 years = 75%</i> <i>20 or more = 100%</i> <i>(Max is 90% of highest HMO plan)</i></p>	<p align="center"><i>Less than 5 years - PEMHCA Minimum</i> <i>5 – 9 years = 25%</i> <i>10 – 14 = 50%</i> <i>15 – 19 years = 75%</i> <i>20 or more = 100%</i> <i>(Max is 90% of highest HMO plan)</i></p>	<p align="center"><i>Less than 5 years - PEMHCA Minimum</i> <i>5 – 9 years = 25%</i> <i>10 – 14 = 50%</i> <i>15 – 19 years = 75%</i> <i>20 or more = 100%</i> <i>(Max is 90% of highest HMO plan)</i></p>	5 years
City of Barstow	\$0	\$300 (includes PEMHCA minimum)	No Additional Contribution	No Additional Contribution	10 years
City of Colton	\$0	<p>Teamsters-General/Confidential PEMHCA Minimum</p> <p>Teamsters-Mid Mngt/Executive 5 years = 40%, with 2% increase each year to max of 30 years= 90% (Cap is \$500/month)</p> <p>IBEW-Water/Wastewater Employees who retire after 15 but less than 20 years of City service shall be eligible for City paid employee only medical insurance coverage, until Medicare age with dependent care available at employee's expense. Employees who retire after having served a minimum of 20 years with the City shall have their and their spouse's, premiums paid for by the City up to Medicare age. After the retiree</p>	<p>Teamsters-General/Confidential No Addition Contribution</p> <p>Teamsters-Mid Mngt/Executive 5 years = 40%, with 2% increase each year to max of 30 years= 90% (Cap is \$500/month)</p> <p>IBEW Water/Wastewater Employees who retire after having served a minimum of 20 years with the City shall have their and their spouse's, premiums paid for by the City up to Medicare age. (Cap- Employees who retire after 15 but less than 20 years of City service shall have a reimbursement cap of \$500 per month until Medicare</p>	<p>Teamsters-General/Confidential No Additional Contribution</p> <p>Teamsters-Mid Mngt/Executive 5 years = 40%, with 2% increase each year to max of 30 years= 90% (Cap is \$500/month)</p> <p>IBEW Water/Wastewater No Additional Contribution</p>	<p>Teamsters-General/Confidential 10 years- PERS; 5 years with Agency</p> <p>Teamsters-Mid Mngt/Executive 5 years</p> <p>IBEW Water/Wastewater 15 years</p>

**APPENDIX B TABLE 3
Retiree Health Benefits
(New Hires)**

Agency	Agency Contribution to Retiree Health Savings	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 1	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 2	Vesting
		reaches Medicare age, he/she can maintain health insurance with the City, but the retiree must pay his/her, and his/her spouse's, premiums. If the retiree is ineligible for Medicare benefits, the City will continue to pay the premiums, as long as the employee remains insurable. For all other employees, all premiums required by their and their spouses' participation in such health insurance plan shall be paid by the employee. (Cap- Employees who retire after 15 but less than 20 years of City service shall have a reimbursement cap of \$500 per month until Medicare age)(employees who retire after having served a minimum of 20 years with the City shall have a reimbursement cap of \$800 per month until Medicare age.)	age)(employees who retire after having served a minimum of 20 years with the City shall have a reimbursement cap of \$800 per month until Medicare age.)		
City of Redlands	\$0	= to least expensive health plan	No Additional Contribution	No Additional Contribution	10 years
City of San Bernardino Water Department	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	NA
Goleta Sanitary District	\$0	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	10 years

APPENDIX B TABLE 3
Retiree Health Benefits
(New Hires)

Agency	Agency Contribution to Retiree Health Savings	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 1	Agency Monthly Contribution for Retiree + 2	Vesting
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	NA
Mountain View Sanitary District	\$0	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	PERS Vesting 10 years = 50%; +5% each additional year; max of 100% with 20 years	10 years
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	NA
Yucaipa Valley Water District	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	NA

APPENDIX B TABLE 4
Education/Certification Pay (beyond minimum requirements)

Survey Agency	Education/Certification Monthly Pay
Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency	<i>None</i>
City of Barstow	Unit 1 Mechanic with ASE cert= 5% Unit 2/6 None
City of Colton	Confidential/General None Mid Management 5%- for a certificate, license, grade or degree IBEW-Water Wastewater 5% -cert
City of Redlands	Management None Mid Management None General Only for Water Distribution certification
City of San Bernardino Water Department	None
Goleta Sanitary District	Only 1x payment of \$1,000
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	557 \$25-AA \$50-BA \$75-MA \$50- One grade or \$25/month if not in spec (to max of \$200) MSC \$50- each cert over to max of \$150

APPENDIX B TABLE 4
Education/Certification Pay (beyond minimum requirements)

Survey Agency	Education/Certification Monthly Pay
	\$25-AA \$50-BA \$75-MA
Mountain View Sanitary District	3%- Grade III 4%- Grade IV 5%- Grade V
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	5% for any cert
Yucaipa Valley Water District	None

APPENDIX B TABLE 6
Sick Leave, Holidays, and Administrative Leave

Agency	Sick Leave Annual Accrual	Sick Leave Max Accrual	Holidays	Administrative/Management Leave/Other Leave
<i>Big Bear Area Regional Wastewater Agency</i>	12	<i>Unlimited</i>	<p align="center"><i>9 + 3 = 12</i></p> <p align="center"><i>At the discretion of the General Manager, Finance Manager, and Plant Manager, Regular employees may receive one additional day (total of two) as an authorized day off with pay when Christmas Day and New Year's Day fall on a Tuesday through Friday. These days will not be considered holidays, but days off at straight-time pay.</i></p>	<i>80 hours - if exempt</i>
City of Barstow	13	Unlimited	<p align="center">12 + 2 = 14</p>	<p align="center">Unit 1 and 2 0</p> <p align="center">Unit 6 90 hours</p>
City of Colton	12	Unlimited	<p align="center">Confidential/Mid Management/IBEW-Water 12 + 2.5 = 14.5</p> <p align="center">General 14.5 + 2 = 16.5</p>	<p align="center">Confidential 80 hours</p> <p align="center">Mid Management 80 hours</p> <p align="center">IBEW-Water/Wastewater 0</p> <p align="center">General 0</p>

APPENDIX B TABLE 6
Sick Leave, Holidays, and Administrative Leave

Agency	Sick Leave Annual Accrual	Sick Leave Max Accrual	Holidays	Administrative/Management Leave/Other Leave
City of Redlands	12	Unlimited	Management $12 + 0 = 12$ Mid Management $12 + 2 = 14$ General $12 + 4.5 = 16.5$	Management 120 hours Mid Management 120 hours General 0
City of San Bernardino Water Department	12	Unlimited	$12 + 27 \text{ hours} = 15.375$	Management/Confidential 80 hours Mid Management 48 hours General 0
Goleta Sanitary District	12	480 hours	$8 + 4 = 12$	At the discretion of General Manager (20 – 40 hours)
Lake Arrowhead Community Services District	12	2,000 hours	$11 + 1 = 12$	0
Mountain View Sanitary District	12	Unlimited	$11 + 5 = 16$	48 hours if exempt 80 hours- District Manager
Victor Valley Wastewater Reclamation	11	Unlimited	$12 + 1 = 13$	40 hours- contract staff Supervisory- at discretion of General Manager
Yucaipa Valley Water District	12	Unlimited	$10 + 3 = 13$	40 hours if exempt

BIG BEAR AREA REGIONAL WASTEWATER AGENCY

PAY SCHEDULE

Current Effective July 3, 2021 vs. Proposed 2022

Classification	Current Start	Current Top	New Start	New Top ^{1,2}	% Change
Hourly Pay Rate:					
Active					
Non-Regular ⁴	\$15.77	\$21.30	\$15.77	\$21.30	-
Plant Operator-In-Training ³	\$18.95	\$25.59 ³	\$18.95	\$25.59 ³	-
Plant Operator II	\$27.78	\$37.50	\$27.78	\$37.50	-
Senior Laboratory Analyst	\$36.28	\$48.97	\$36.28	\$48.97	-
Plant Supervisor	\$37.55	\$50.70	\$38.13	\$51.47	1.52%
Operations Administrative/Laboratory Assistant ³	\$26.80	\$36.18	\$26.80	\$36.18 ³	-
Management Analyst/Board Secretary	\$32.08	\$43.32	\$32.08	\$43.32	-
Human Resources Coordinator / Accounting Technician ³	\$39.74	\$53.65 ³	\$39.74	\$53.65 ³	-
Plant Manager	\$50.55	\$73.30	\$56.50	\$76.28	4.07%
Finance Manager	\$53.87	\$78.11	\$57.86	\$78.11	-
General Manager ³	\$78.92	\$114.44 ³	\$84.77	\$114.44 ³	-

1. New top of scale set to the adjusted labor market median (±5%) per December 2021 study of the comparable agencies.
2. Starting pay will be set to the current range from top of scale (35% spread).
3. Pay range is frozen until released by Governing Board action.
4. Non-Regular pay is set by the General Manager and classification was not included in the compensation study.

COMPENSATION STUDIES

I. PURPOSE

To establish uniform practices for periodic compensation studies. All compensation studies are for informational purposes only and do not commit the Agency to salary adjustments. Compensation studies can help to determine the appropriate level and validity of salary ranges and overall compensation structures and can contribute to financial and rate stability over time.

II. POLICY

- A. **Compensation Study Update.** The Agency currently utilizes a consulting firm to update its compensation study on an annual basis. The study compares each of the Agency's job positions (referred to as classifications within the study) with comparable positions among a comparable agency group (the Comparable Group). The Comparable Group currently consists of nine agencies. Not all agencies in the Comparable Group have positions that are comparable to the Agency's.
- B. **Compensation Study Labor Market Data.** The study compares Maximum Salary, Total Cash and Total Compensation by job position. The Agency uses Total Cash as the measure for comparison. Total Cash currently includes maximum salary, employer paid member contributions, deferred compensation, longevity pay, and certification pay. The Agency has determined that it wants to remain competitive with the market based on total cash compensation for each position, not just maximum salary. Total Compensation includes health premiums among other items of comparison. The geographic disparity of health premiums reduces the reliability of Total Compensation as a true market indicator of compensation.
- C. **Assessing the Labor Market Data.** The labor market median for each position is used as the basis for the comparison (to the Agency's comparable position).
- i. If Total Cash for the comparable position is plus or minus five percent from the labor market median, no adjustment to the pay range is indicated.
 - ii. If Total Cash for the comparable position is more than five percent below the market median, an adjustment to the pay range to five percent below the labor market median is indicated.
 - iii. If Total Cash for the comparable position is more than five percent above the labor market median, an adjustment of the pay range to five percent above the labor market median is indicated, provided that the position is currently vacant. If the position is filled, the current pay range will be frozen, and inflationary, cost-of-living adjustments to the pay range will not be granted until after the next study update or until determined otherwise. Using this method, the higher-than-market pay range will correct downward over time.
- D. **Making Market Adjustments.** If an adjustment is indicated, the following calculations will be made to determine the recommended pay range to be included in the Agency's publicly available pay schedule.

- i. For any position in which an adjustment is indicated, the Maximum Salary will be adjusted to the point at which Maximum Salary when combined with the other items of Total Cash is equal to the adjusted labor market median. The adjusted labor market median is plus or minus 5% of the labor market median pursuant to Section II. C. ii. or iii.
- ii. Maximum Salary will be used to determine the top of the Agency's pay range for the position. The beginning of the pay range is determined by applying the percentage range from starting salary to maximum salary – 45% range for management positions and 35% range for all other positions.

E. **Market Adjustment Limitations and Considerations.** When making market adjustments the following will apply.

- i. No market adjustment will exceed 10%.
- ii. If an Agency position has four or less comparable positions in the market (less than 50% of the market), discretion should be exercised prior to any adjustments. If an adjustment is indicated, reasons for the market adjustment should be understood and validated. With such a small comparable group, movements in the labor market median can be volatile and invalid. A market adjustment may be limited to an inflationary adjustment based on an Agency cost-of-living adjustment until the next study update.

Compensation Study Update

December 2021

Background

Compensation Studies Completed:

- July 2017
 - Comprehensive Compensation and Classification Study
- July 2018, September 2019, and November 2020
 - Annual Updates with Pay Range Adjustments
 - Compensation Studies Policy Adopted to Guide Pay Range Adjustments
- December 2021 - Current Update
 - 4th Annual Update Completed

Compensation Studies Policy

- Provide Consistency and Stability in Pay Range Adjustments
 - If Pay Range is within 5% of the Market, No Adjustment
 - If Pay Range is more than 5% below Market, Adjustment to 5% below Market
 - If Pay Range is more than 5% above Market and the position is currently filled, No Adjustment and Pay Range is frozen
 - If pay Range is more than 5% above Market and the position is unfilled, Adjustment to 5% above Market
 - No Pay Range is adjusted by more than 10%
 - If an Agency position has four or less comparable positions in the market (less than 50% of the market), discretion should be exercised prior to any adjustments.

Study Method – Total Cash

Base Salary	→	Total Cash	→	Total Compensation
	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. EPMC – Employer Pick up of Pension Contribution2. 457 Employer Match3. Longevity4. Certification Pay		<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Medical Premiums2. Cafeteria Plan3. Insurance4. Social Security Benefits	

Total Compensation Not Used

- wide variances in medical benefits that can result from geographic variances
- complex nature of assessing and comparing benefits across the comparable groups

Current Study Results

Position	above or below Market Median Total Cash
Plant Manager	-9.26 %
Plant Supervisor	-6.60 %
Senior Laboratory Analyst	-1.36 %
Finance Manager	-0.83 %
Management Analyst/Board Sec	0.05 %
Plant Operator II	1.83 %
Plant Operator-in-Training	5.43 %
General Manager	9.85 %
HR Coordinator/Accounting Tech	10.67 %
Operations Administrative/Lab Asst	20.29 %
Average	3.49 %

40% OF ALL POSITIONS ARE WITHIN 5% OF THE MEDIAN

Factors Influencing Study Results

3 of 9 Comparable Agencies Stopped Paying Employee's Share of Retirement Contribution in 2019/2020

- Makes BBARWA's relative Total Cash higher; keeps Base Salaries lower
- Plant Manager (increase base salary 4.07%)
 - A reduction of comparables and shift in the labor market median in 2020 placed the compensation significantly under market.
 - This adjustment will bring Total Cash to 5% below market median.
- Plant Supervisor (increase base salary 1.52%)
 - Comparables were reduced from 6 to 5. Shift in labor market median.
 - This adjustment will bring Total Cash to 5% below market median.

Factors Influencing Study Results

- General Manager (freeze)
 - Decreases in salaries at Lake Arrowhead, Mountain View, and Victor Valley in 2020 resulted in a lower labor market median.
 - Pay range frozen with the 2020 study (no COLA adjustment to pay range)
 - Still above market.
- HR Coordinator/Accounting Technician (freeze)
 - Pay range frozen since 2019 study (no COLA adjustment to pay range)
 - Still above market, but gap is closing.
- O-I-T (freeze)
 - Only 4 comparable matches. It is common for agencies to have OIT as intern/non-benefitted position only, resulting in limited compensation data.
 - Pay range was first frozen with the 2020 study, and the gap has closed by more than 40%.
- Operations Administrative/Laboratory Assistant (freeze)
 - Position was reclassified in April 2021. A change in job specifications resulted in a new pool of comparable classifications in the 2021 study and a reduction in comparables from 8 to 5.

Changes to Pay Schedule

1. Increase Plant Manager Pay Range bringing Total Cash compensation to 5% below Market Median
2. Increase Plant Supervisor Pay Range bringing Total Cash compensation to 5% below Market Median
3. Freeze Pay Range - No COLA Adjustment to Pay Schedule if pay range is frozen
 - General Manager
 - HR Coordinator/Accounting Technician
 - Operations Administrative/Laboratory Assistant
 - Plant Operator-in-Training

**BIG BEAR AREA REGIONAL WASTEWATER AGENCY
PAY SCHEDULE Proposed New 2022**

Classification	Start (a)	Top	\$ Change to Top of Scale
Hourly Pay Rate:			
Non-Regular (b)	\$15.77	\$21.30	
Plant Operator-In-Training (d)	\$18.95	\$25.59	freeze
Plant Operator II	\$27.78	\$37.50	
Senior Laboratory Analyst	\$36.28	\$48.97	
Plant Supervisor(c)	\$38.13	\$51.47	\$0.77
Operations Administrative/Lab Assistant (d)	\$26.80	\$36.18	freeze
Management Analyst/Board Secretary	\$32.08	\$43.32	
Human Resources Coordinator / Accounting Technician (d)	\$39.74	\$53.65	freeze
Plant Manager(c)	\$56.50	\$76.28	\$2.98
Finance Manager	\$57.86	\$78.11	
General Manager (d)	\$84.77	\$114.44	freeze
Total			\$3.75

(a) Starting pay is set to the current range from top of scale (35% spread).

(b) Non-Regular Pay Range is set by the General Manager and classification was not included in the compensation study.

(c) Pay Range is increased to 5% below market as a result of 2021 Compensation Study.

(d) Pay Range is frozen. No COLA adjustment to Pay Range until after the next study update or determined otherwise.